Inclusive City Quarterly Report February 2021



FEBRUARY 9

City of Bozeman Inclusive City Project Team



City Manager Update

In July of 2020, staff came before the City Commission with the Inclusive City report. This internal report has 24 actions describing how we can continue to strive towards a more equitable and inclusive organization and community.

This is the second quarterly report staff have brought to the Commission and we are excited about the significant work and progress that has been accomplished in the last three months. To view the November report visit our website at www.bozeman.net/equityandinclusion. This report includes a list of actions that have been completed along with updates for any new completed items, updates on actions that are in progress, along with a detailed timeline and associated budget for all actions. Words matter in this work, and it's important to point out that many of these items may never be "complete" but will be "ongoing" efforts that the City is dedicated to incorporating as a part of routine work.

There are many areas of progress in this report including the significant amount of **training completed by staff** across the City and within our Police Department. As mentioned in the previous report, the Bozeman Police Department recently updated the Use of Force policy and moved to a Bias-free Policing policy, aligning with national best practices. All officers in the department have now completed training on the changes made, in addition to three other trainings on topics like implicit bias, decision making, and de-escalation. Also, thanks to the launch of our new learning management system (LMS) we were able to train all city employees on workplace diversity and incorporate the training into our new hire program!

Our completed work in training is just the first step. Across departments, the City is excited to undertake a **city-wide**, **all employee**, **directors and elected officials training through National League of Cities' Race**, **Equity and Leadership (REAL) program**. This work is intentionally required of all members of this organization as we continue work to normalize and understand the areas for growth as a City.

Lastly I'd like to highlight the work that is to come in **development of equity indicators and a community gaps analysis.** This effort will take place over the course of the spring and relies heavily on engaging with our community partners and all Bozeman folks. In the following months our consultant, city staff, and all of our stakeholders will dive deep into the data and the stories of our area to analyze gaps and create living data points to measure our progress. This groundwork is the most critical effort we can undertake before stepping into the work of creating an Equity and Inclusion Plan.

In the simplest terms, our goal is to ensure that every resident, visitor, and City of Bozeman employee feels welcomed and valued, and has the opportunity to thrive no matter their race, identity, or life circumstance. – Jeff Mihelich

Completed Actions

For further detail on completed actions please review previous reports on our website at www.bozeman.net/equityandinclusion

City Manager Recommendations

1. Provide a quarterly progress report to the City Commission and interested stakeholders

The next report will be delivered in May 2021.

6. Become a member of the Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE)

The City of Bozeman was accepted into GARE in November 2020. Bozeman is now the first organization from Montana to be a part of GARE! As a part of the City's membership there are opportunities to learn from leaders in the space as well as share successes. Several staff have already completed the GARE Foundations training course "Advancing Racial Equity: The Role of Government" and are utilizing the network to ensure the City's actions are in line with best practices.

Diversity, Inclusion and interaction with Minorities – Bozeman Police Department

2. Augment existing policies and update to "Bias-free Policing"

The Bozeman Police Department has reviewed its existing policies against the <u>model policy of "Bias-Free Policing"</u> and updated the department's existing policies where necessary to be in line with this national best practice (See Appendix A.) The final policy has now replaced the prior policy and staff have completed a training program which highlighted the changes and the key points.

Use of Force – Bozeman Police Department

1. Policy Changes

The Bozeman Police Department has made revisions to the current policy which includes providing additional policy direction concerning de-escalation and use of force. The goal of the updates is to address community concerns and provide clarity for officers. As a result, a new and updated "Use of Force" policy (see Appendix B) has been finalized and approved. The updated policy has been implemented and staff have completed a training program to familiarize them with the changes.

In Progress Actions

City Manager Recommendations

2. Identify anti-discrimination, implicit bias and systemic racism training for elected officials and department heads.

The project Training Team has recommended the <u>National League of Cities' Race</u>, <u>Equity And Leadership (REAL)</u> training program as the partner to deliver REAL 100: Normalizing Racial Equity in Local Government Training to all city staff, including elected officials and department heads. It is very important that everyone in our organization, regardless of position, experience this base-line training. The process includes an employee assessment that will take place leading into the training that will assist in identifying follow-up training needs after this 100-level course. Staff estimate that these assessments and the REAL 100 training will be delivered, virtually, to all employees within the next 90 days (by April 30th).

Staff had hoped to have a full training calendar developed in December however, with the upcoming work with the REAL Program and the hiring of our Human Resources Director; staff believe that a more formalized training calendar will be complete in the coming quarter.

3. Develop a City Equity and Inclusion Plan to engage stakeholders and identify gaps community wide and to implement policies that help all persons in Bozeman thrive regardless of economic, racial, cultural, or gender identity.

Staff have begun work with Thomas P. Miller & Associates to begin work to develop equity indicators and conduct a gaps analysis to better understand inequities that exist in our community across race, ethnicity, gender identity and other socioeconomic factors. The process includes characterizing the disparities faced by underrepresented groups, evaluating the capacity of existing services in the community to address those inequities; and developing a set of equity indicators that will allow the City to establish a baseline and track change over time. This data collection and community engagement effort will lay the groundwork for the Equity and Inclusion Plan as well as the Equity and Inclusion Summit.

The project is expected to be complete in July 2021. Phase 1 will take place in February through May 2021 and will include initial stakeholder identification and engagement as well as background research and outreach to community organizations and agency partners to determine data availability and collect existing data. Phase 2 in April, May, and June 2021 will include data analysis and completion of the gaps analysis portion of the project to synthesize available or missing services in our community to address inequities found during community engagement and data collection. Phase 3 will occur in June and July 2021 and will focus on the development and finalization of equity indicators based on data collection, analysis, and stakeholder input.

5. Accelerate the implementation of body worn cameras for the Bozeman Police Department.

Staff had previously submitted a proposal as a part of the Capital Improvement Plan (CIP) to move body worn cameras into the budget for the upcoming fiscal year. Due to the complexities of these systems, including data storage requirements, it is essential that any new system include the patrol car video camera systems and the new Bozeman Public Safety Center interview rooms. In December, Police Department staff prepared and published a Request for Proposals, which received numerous vendor replies in January. As of the writing of this report, staff has narrowed the applicant field to three vendors, with demonstrations and final vendor selection both scheduled for later in February. This aggressive timeline will ensure the new vendor is selected in time for inclusion in the BPSC, with the remainder of the implementation plan being guided by the availability of funding and purchase or lease options offered by the selected vendor. Once these factors are finalized, staff will put together a significant community engagement process.

Anti-discrimination

1. Implement additional training for all city staff.

As mentioned above under City Manager's Recommendation Action 2, the project Training Team has recommended the National League of Cities' Race, Equity And Leadership (REAL) training program as the partner to deliver REAL 100: Normalizing Racial Equity in Local Government Training to all city staff, including elected officials and department heads. Implementation is expected to be complete by April 30, 2021.

Additionally, the team will establish a 12 month training calendar for all employees by Spring 2021 which will include quarterly trainings and annual/semi-annual workshops or speakers. We will be relying on our work with the REAL Program, and the hiring of our Human Resources Manager to aid in creation of the calendar.

In the last quarter, the Human Resources Department deployed an introductory Workplace Diversity training to all staff through the new learning management system. As of January 26^{th,} 92.61% of employees completed the training. Leadership will continue to prioritize completion of this training with their staff. This training has also been included in the City's new hire orientation and will be completed by new staff as they come in to the organization.

Lastly, as a member benefit through GARE, staff within the Inclusive City Team have begun training through GARE Foundations. Several staff completed training in Advancing Racial Equity: The Role of Government and five more are expected to complete the training in the next quarter.

Training	Date Completed	Length	# Staff Trained	Comments
Workplace	Started December	1 hour	92.61% of all	Cultural diversity can strengthen an
Diversity	2020, Ongoing		employees	organization's values and enhance community awareness. Due to our
				country's rapid growth and ever- changing diverse populations, organizations are realizing strength in
				the marketplace is linked to their ability to attract a culturally diverse workforce.
				Unfortunately, discrimination still occurs on many levels. The goals of this

				program are to promote awareness and encourage acceptance, describe strategies to create a positive and accepting work environment, and to highlight the steps to take should discrimination occur in the workplace.
GARE Foundations Advancing Racial Equity: The Role of Government	Started December 2020, Ongoing	6 hours	3	This course provides an introduction to the role, responsibilities and opportunities for government to advance racial equity. Participants gain awareness of the history of race and of implicit and explicit bias and individual, institutional, and structural racism and how it impacts the workplace. The course also focuses on normalizing racial equity as a core value with clear definitions of key terminology, operationalizing racial equity via new policies and institutional practices, and organizing, both internally and in partnership with other institutions and the community. Participants also become skilled at identifying and addressing institutional and structural racism.

4. Review best practice recommendations, including the THRIVE index and the Municipal Equality index

City staff had initial discussions on the City's current scores in the THRIVE index (**Appendix C**) and the Municipal Equality Index (**Appendix D**.) Based on the City's scores from 2019, the team has identified several key areas where additional progress can be made:

- 1. THRIVE Index: We believe that we may be able to improve our Paid Parental Leave policies to assist employees who fall through the gaps within our current Sick Leave Bank system or are generally unaware of the policy. The Human Resources Director is investigating the issue and will make recommendations to the City Manager within the coming months.
- 2. Municipal Equality Index: We see continued opportunities for leadership in the area of Pro-Equality Legislative Efforts during the current Legislative Session, by opposing Anti-Transgender and other anti-equality legislation. We also believe that we may achieve the Index's goals towards an Inclusive Workplace with expanded workplace training and targeted recruitment efforts within the LGBTQ community. These are items that we will be working on in the coming months.

Diversity, inclusion and interaction with minorities – Bozeman Police Department

1. Training

This item will be an ongoing effort by the Bozeman Police Department to explore additional training opportunities on topics including recognizing implicit bias, anti-racial profiling and Bias-Free policing.

Training	Date Completed	Length	# Staff Trained	Comments
Implicit Bias	November 2020	2.5 hours	64 (all officers)	Officers completed an online course intended to help them understand how implicit bias impacts actions and decisions. The course examined the relationship between unconscious and implicit bias, addressed illicit bias and how it affects decision making, and discussed the importance of communicating effectively.

Use of Force

1. Training

This item will be an ongoing effort by the Bozeman Police Department to incorporate more communication and de-escalation, scenario-based, in-service trainings for officers. Staff will also evaluate and consider additional training programs on topics that include communication, de-escalation, intervention, recognizing force mitigation opportunities, use of force decision-making and more.

Training	Date Completed	Length	# Staff Trained	Comments
Decision Making	November 2020	2 hours	64 (all officers)	Officers attended a training regarding making good decisions during critical incidents. This training included the science behind why poor decisions are sometimes made, the inherent "fight or flight" response and how to overcome it, and how to remain calm and think critically during high-stress incidents.
De-escalation, Intervention, and Force Mitigation	January 2021	2 hours	62 (all officers)	Officers completed an online course focusing on "De-Escalation, Intervention, and Force Mitigation." After defining each term, the training discussed the importance of focusing on a "guardian" mindset, described a variety of factors involved in human interaction, and explored techniques for lowering emotions to change behavior in volatile situations.

Citizen Appeal Process

- 1. Create a stand-alone citizen complaint policy.
- 2. Clearly distinguish inquiries from complaints.
- 3. Refine the complaint investigative process.

These action items are interconnected and, for the sake of this report, are considered dependent upon each other. Staff have spent considerable time discussing this process during monthly meetings in an effort to ensure a fair, sufficient, and transparent process. Staff have finalized the distinction between "inquiries" and "complaints," and are currently creating a template for workflow stemming from each category. The intent in creating a clearer workflow is to separate "minor complaints" form "major complaints," then distinguish which major complaints will require an administrative investigation and which will require an external investigation. Upon completion of the appropriate investigation, the goal is to have clearly classified dispositions to ensure transparency, fairness, and consistency. As this effort progresses, staff are continuing to update the overall policy to reflect the decisions that are being made. As of this report, discussions are still being held regarding how the citizen's appeal process will operate, including who will conduct the review, exactly what the reviewer's role will be, and how a citizen will request a review. Work is ongoing in this complicated and varied process.

Bozeman as an Inclusive City Report – Actions, Budget, Timeline

Green = Complete

Yellow = In progress or Ongoing

Red = Not yet started

City Manager Recommendations

Based on the review of our existing policies, procedures, training protocols and best practices the City Manager

recommends the following actions:

ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
1. PROVIDE A QUARTERLY PROGRESS REPORT TO THE CITY COMMISSION AND INTERESTED STAKEHOLDERS	CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE	IMMEDIATELY - FIRST REPORT NOVEMBER 2020	\$0
2. IDENTIFY ANTI-DISCRIMINATION, IMPLICIT BIAS AND SYSTEMIC RACISM TRAINING FOR ELECTED OFFICIALS AND DEPARTMENT HEADS	HUMAN RESOURCES/CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE	DEVELOP 12-MONTH TRAINING PROGRAM BY DECEMBER 2020	\$12,000
3. DEVELOP A CITY DIVERSITY, EQUITY AND INCLUSION PLAN TO ENGAGE STAKEHOLDERS AND IDENTIFY GAPS COMMUNITY WIDE AND TO IMPLEMENT POLICIES THAT HELP ALL PERSONS IN BOZEMAN THRIVE REGARDLESS OF ECONOMIC, RACIAL, CULTURAL, OR GENDER IDENTITY	CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE	18 MONTHS	UNKNOWN
4. Sponsor a Diversity, Equity and Inclusion summit with community partners such as Montana State University, HRDC, and Montana Racial Equity Project	CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE	2021	UNKNOWN
5. ACCELERATE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF BODY WORN CAMERAS FOR THE BOZEMAN POLICE DEPARTMENT	BOZEMAN POLICE DEPARTMENT	BPD WILL HAVE RECOMMENDATION ON TIMELINE AS A PART OF THE UPCOMING CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PLANNING PROCESS AND WILL MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS ON FISCAL YEAR.	BPD WILL HAVE COST ESTIMATES AS A PART OF THE UPCOMING CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PLANNING PROCESS.

6. BECOME A MEMBER OF THE	CITY MANAGER'S	IMMEDIATELY	\$1,000 ANNUALLY
GOVERNMENT ALLIANCE ON RACE	OFFICE		
AND EQUITY			

Overall Diversity for the Organization

ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
1. Make diversity a formal AND HIGH PRIORITY FOR THE ORGANIZATION The City will communicate its commitment to diversity to all city staff and significantly increase formal training for supervisors and employees on implicit bias. The City will review and adjust its employee performance appraisal system to ensure consistency of evaluations and non- discrimination.	CITY MANAGER	HOLD ALL CITY STAFF MEETING AND PASS ADMINISTRATIVE ORDER	\$0

Anti-discrimination

Anti-discrimination		I	I .
ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
1. IMPLEMENT ADDITIONAL TRAINING FOR ALL CITY STAFF	HUMAN RESOURCES	LMS "WORKPLACE DIVERSITY" DEPLOYED TO ALL EMPLOYEES BY DECEMBER. ESTABLISH A 12 MONTH TRAINING CALENDAR FOR ALL EMPLOYEES BY MARCH 2021	WE HAVE A SYSTEM WITH THESE TYPES OF TRAININGS INCLUDED BUT MAY NEED FUNDING FOR IN PERSON TRAINING
The City will consider more frequent and additional trainings including trainings on "Inclusion in the Workplace" and "Implicit Bias"			
2. EMPLOYEE ENGAGEMENT SURVEYS	HUMAN RESOURCES	SPRING 2021	\$0
The City will engage employees annually to gauge inclusion and engagement in the workplace to measure the success of other efforts by the City.			
3. EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM	HUMAN RESOURCES	FY22	\$0
The City will review its employee performance appraisal system and provide updates with greater consideration to fairness and inclusion.			
4. REVIEW BEST PRACTICE	HUMAN	INITIAL MEETING	\$0 FOR INITIAL
RECOMMENDATIONS, INCLUDING	RESOURCES/CITY	WITH CITY MANAGER	REVIEW.
THE THRIVE INDEX AND THE	MANAGER'S OFFICE	TO REVIEW THESE	IMPLEMENTING NEW
MUNICIPAL EQUALITY INDEX		PROGRAM ELEMENTS IN JANUARY 2021	ELEMENTS MAY REQUIRE FUNDING.
The City will review the best practices of the THRIVE index and the Human Rights Campaign's Municipality Equality index and consider City policies that may need additional updates to meet these best practices.			
5. REVIEW HOW THE CITY HANDLES ANONYMOUS COMPLAINTS (ETHICS ORDINANCE)	CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE	2022	\$0

The City will review the current policies within the ethics ordinance that requires complainants to give their name before complaints are given a complaint investigation status. The review will consider the failures of the policy to meet the needs of the victim and should be updated to reflect those needs.			
6. EVALUATE DIVERSITY &	CITY CLERK'S OFFICE	SUMMER 2021	\$0
INCLUSION ON ADVISORY BOARDS			
The City will conduct an evaluation of City Advisory Boards to determine how or if the City tracks diversity on these boards and consider systems that could be implemented to support diversity and inclusion in these spaces.			

<u>Diversity, inclusion and interaction with minorities – Bozeman Police</u> <u>Department</u>

Department			
ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
1. ADD FUTURE TRAININGS	POLICE DEPARTMENT		
The Bozeman Police Department will explore additional training opportunities on topics including recognizing implicit bias, anti-racial profiling, and Bias-Free Policing.	IMPLICIT BIAS TRAINING (ONLINE) (2.5 HR)	NOVEMBER 2020	\$3,400
2. AUGMENT EXISTING POLICIES AND UPDATE TO "BIAS-FREE POLICING"	POLICE DEPARTMENT		
The Bozeman Police Department will review its existing policies against the model policy of "Bias-Free Policing" and update existing policies where necessary to be in line with this national best practice.		COMPLETED AND TRAINING IMPLEMENTED	\$0
3. Broaden Community Outreach Events			
The Bozeman Police Department will give continued consideration to broadening community outreach events to interact with more Montana State University groups as well as other community groups.	POLICE DEPARTMENT	TO BE DETERMINED DEPENDENT UPON PANDEMIC- RELATED RESTRICTIONS	N/A

<u>Hiring Practices - Overall</u>

Tilling Fractices Overall	T	I	
ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF
		IMPLEMENTATION	AVAILABLE, NOTE IF
			ALREADY BUDGETED
			FOR AND WHAT FISCAL
			YEAR)
	HUMAN RESOURCES	APRIL 2021	MAY NEED MINIMAL
1. CONTINUED EFFORTS TO REACH			AMOUNTS FOR JOB
OUR BEST PRACTICES			POSTINGS TO NICHE
The City will continue to evaluate			GROUPS.
and improve its efforts to achieve			
our best practices in hiring and			
recruitment. This includes			
improving our results for			
candidates and evaluating the			
impacts of turnover.	Harris Barrier	2024 2022	ė o
2. UPDATE HIRING PRACTICES	HUMAN RESOURCES	2021-2022	\$0
POLICY			
The City will update the hiring			
practices manual to reflect current			
practices and further efforts for			
diversity. The City will also train			
supervisors to the hiring practices			
and hold supervisors accountable			
for not following hiring practices.	II	2024	÷20,000
3. REVIEW AND UPDATE THE	HUMAN RESOURCES	2021	\$20,000
LANGUAGE AND IMAGES USED FOR			
ADVERTISING POSITIONS			
The City will review the language		WORK WITH A	
and images used for recruiting and		CONSULT TO DEVELOP	
advertising open city positions to specialized groups. Language and		NEW VISUAL AND	
images should take into		WRITTEN MATERIALS	
consideration literal and visual			
differences in varied applicant			
pools.			
•			

Use of Force

ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
The Bozeman Police Department will make revisions to the current BPD policy and provide additional policy direction concerning deescalation and use of force. These updates hope to address community concerns and provide clarity for officers.	POLICE DEPARTMENT	COMPLETE AND TRAINING IMPLEMENTED	\$0
2. FUTURE TRAININGS	POLICE DEPARTMENT		
The Bozeman Police Department will incorporate more communication and de-escalation scenario-based in-service trainings for officers. They will also evaluate and consider	DECISION MAKING (IN PERSON FOR OFFICERS) (2 HR)	NOVEMBER 2020	\$0
additional training programs on topics that include communication, de-escalation, intervention, recognizing force mitigation opportunities, use of force decision-making, and others.	DE-ESCALATION AND FORCE MITIGATION (ONLINE FOR ALL OFFICERS) (2 HR)	FALL 2020	\$3,400

Citizen Appeal Process – Bozeman Police Department

ACTION ITEM	LEAD DEPARTMENT	TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTATION	BUDGET (ESTIMATE IF AVAILABLE, NOTE IF ALREADY BUDGETED FOR AND WHAT FISCAL YEAR)
1. CREATE A STAND-ALONE CITIZEN COMPLAINT POLICY			
The Bozeman Police Department will create a stand-alone Citizen Complaint Policy that will be available on the City's website with clear instructions on how to file a complaint, the complaint investigation process, timeline for response, and steps for further engagement after an outcome has been determined.	POLICE DEPARTMENT	SPRING 2021	\$0
2. CLEARLY DISTINGUISH INQUIRIES FROM COMPLAINTS			
The Bozeman Police Department will create a process, including defining the terms "inquiry" and "complaint" to clearly distinguish inquiries from complaints requiring an investigation and create a system for documenting inquiries.	POLICE DEPARTMENT	SPRING 2021	\$0
3. REFINE THE COMPLAINT INVESTIGATIVE PROCESS			
The Bozeman Police Department will review and update the Complaint Investigative Process to establish a clear timeframe for notification and follow-up within 24 hours with a complainant. The Bozeman Police Department will also explore options for developing an appeal process for citizens that are unsatisfied with the outcome of a complaint investigation.	POLICE DEPARTMENT	SPRING 2021	\$0